



## **15<sup>TH</sup> MEETING OF THE INDEPENDENT ADVISORY PANEL ON CHARACTERISING FLAVOURS IN TOBACCO PRODUCTS (IAP)**

**PLACE: RUE FROISSART 101, 1040 BRUSSELS**

**17 September 2019**

### **MINUTES**

#### **1. INTRODUCTION AND WELCOME**

The Chair welcomed the members of the panel. There were no apologies.

#### **2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA**

The agenda was adopted as proposed.

#### **3. DECLARATION OF INTERESTS**

There were no new interests declared.

#### **4. ADOPTION OF MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING**

The minutes of the last meeting were adopted and would be published on the website of the IAP subsequent to the meeting.<sup>1</sup>

#### **5. DISCUSSION ON THE PROGRESS OF THE TASKS CARRIED OUT BY THE TECHNICAL GROUP OF SENSORY AND CHEMICAL ASSESSORS**

The IAP briefly discussed the documents and information received prior to the meeting, both internally (following the teleconference of 5 September) and from the Technical Group of Sensory and Chemical Assessors (TG). This included a revised flowchart taking into consideration discussions in the last meeting which was considered as an alternative to the flowchart developed by the TG. In this respect, it was decided to focus further discussion with the TG on the key considerations for the decision criteria whether a tobacco product has a characterising flavour.

#### **6. EXCHANGE WITH THE TECHNICAL GROUP OF SENSORY AND CHEMICAL ASSESSORS**

The Consortium EUREST-FLAVOURS organizing the work of the TG presented the work carried out since the last exchange, in particular on the following aspects:

- Further refinement of the methodology, including the flowchart for determining whether a tobacco product has a characterising flavour (task 2).

---

<sup>1</sup> [https://ec.europa.eu/health/tobacco/products/characterising\\_flavours/panel\\_en#fragment0](https://ec.europa.eu/health/tobacco/products/characterising_flavours/panel_en#fragment0)

- Specific considerations for inclusion of specific product categories (RYO tobacco with perceptible “smoky” flavour) in the group of reference products;

The IAP discussed the further refined approach presented by the TG and provided feedback. There was an agreement in principle achieved on:

- a. Cut-off value of attribute scores for determining whether to perform rank-rating,
- b. Further examination of specific flavour attributes found in traditional tobacco products, which may result in a characterising flavour,
- c. The decision to use targeted chemical analysis to identify the key compounds potentially responsible for characterising flavour. Selection of which target compounds to measure can be informed by many methods: literature data, flavours database, EU-CEG, and full-scan GC-MS,
- d. The methodology report (Task 2) should i.a. provide the description of the process for selecting appropriate chemical tests together with measures, which will be taken to warrant reliable analytical results. In this respect, TG would propose a set of suitable methods described in the standard operating procedures,
- e. The methodology report should also provide the description of selecting the appropriate statistical test including the scientific reasoning for the selection of the test, e.g. boundary conditions or power of the test.

Once the methodological work on Task 2 is concluded, the TG will prepare an edited version for publication on the IAP website.

## **7. FUTURE WORK/NEXT STEPS**

For the next meeting the TG should further develop the criteria for selection of a neutral product for rank-rating dilution (preferably commercial tobacco on the EU market from the list of reference products), perform additional rank-rating tests on flavoured products to demonstrate the suitability of proposed cut-off points and reflect on determination of specific flavour attributes, e.g. found in traditional tobacco products.

The IAP will hold a teleconference on 7 November and provide the TG with additional feedback on the ongoing work.

## **8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

None

## **LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

### **Members of the IAP**

Alberto Del Rio  
Garnt Dijksterhuis  
Jan van Amsterdam  
Emmanuel Vanzeveren  
Wouter Visser  
Efthimios Zervas (Chair)

### **IAP secretariat** (DG SANTE B2)

Katja Bromen  
Matus Ferech

### **Other Commission services - DG JRC F4**

Thomas Wenzl

### **Representatives from the EUREST-FLAVOURS consortium**